

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 simply want to clarify for the record that we don't know
2 the circumstances under which these documents were
3 stapled together. We have a representation that they
4 were stapled together incorrectly. We just don't know
5 the circumstances under which that occurred.

6 BY MR. PUTNAM:

7 Q Mr. Suttie, first of all, am I right that the
8 document you have in front of you that has the exhibit
9 sticker of Suttie 11 on it contains, in addition to the
10 pages that I just read for the record, pages HSA 176477,
11 78 and 79?

12 A Yes, it does.

13 Q Are those three pages part of the rest of the
14 document as it was originally created by you?

15 A This document was not created by me.

16 Q Those last three pages? Are those three pages
17 pages that were attached to the fax that Mr. Fleming
18 sent to you?

19 A I do not know.

20 Q Do you see on Mr. Fleming's fax cover sheet
21 that he says that the first page here is Page 1 of 13?

22 A I do.

23 Q Would you agree with me that counting back, the
24 13th page is the one that is HSA 161476?

25 A So the question, is the last page 1476?

93

1 the fax that Bob Fleming sent to you, correct?

2 A It appears to be.

3 Q And am I correct that you then circulated this
4 document to a number of people inside Sundstrand in
5 San Diego?

6 A Yes.

7 Q And that's the list of the four people in the
8 column on the left bottom middle of the page; is that
9 right?

10 A Yes.

11 Q Was Peg your secretary in November 1992?

12 A Yes.

13 Q And so am I correct that this note was both a
14 note to your secretary to send copies to the individuals
15 you listed, and then a note that you wanted to convey to
16 those individuals, correct?

17 A Yes.

18 Q And am I correct that these four individuals
19 you were sending it to were all people who were working
20 at the time on developing the control systems for the
21 APS 3200?

22 A Yes.

23 Q Am I correct that the document that is attached
24 to the cover page is a document that describes the
25 operation of Allied Signal's GTCP 331-350 APU?

95

1 Q Yes, sir. Is that the last page of what
2 Mr. Fleming sent you, based on the page count on the
3 first page of the fax and also based on your reference
4 on the first page of the fax to the second-to-last page,
5 which I believe is HSA 161475?

6 A The answer to your question is yes.

7 Q Okay. Can you please remove from the exhibit
8 pages HSA 161477, 478 and 479.

9 MR. MCCracken: I would like to -- can we go
10 off the record for just a moment?

11 MR. PUTNAM: Sure.

12 (Discussion off the record.)

13 (Deposition Exhibit 12 marked.)

14 MR. PUTNAM: For the record, at your request,
15 Mr. McCracken, we have marked as Suttie Exhibit 12 pages
16 HSA 161477, 478 and 479 that were the three pages
17 originally inadvertently attached to Suttie Exhibit 11.

18 Q Mr. Suttie, do you have Exhibit 11 in front of
19 you?

20 A Yes.

21 Q And am I correct that Exhibit 11 as it
22 currently sits in front of you starts with HSA 161463
23 and goes through HSA 161476?

24 A Yes.

25 Q Am I correct that you circulate -- and this is

94

1 MR. MCCracken: Objection; ambiguity.

2 Ambiguous.

3 THE WITNESS: I can't answer that without
4 reading every page.

5 BY MR. PUTNAM:

6 Q Well, when you received the document from
7 Mr. Fleming, then passed it on to your colleagues, what
8 did you understand the document to be?

9 A I don't recall what I thought the document to
10 be back then.

11 Q Take as much time as you need to, and tell me
12 now what the document is.

13 A Some of the pages have reference to GTCP APUs.

14 Q And is it your understanding that the pages
15 that don't explicitly mention the Allied Signal APU by
16 name are nonetheless talking about the operation of
17 Allied Signal APUs?

18 A That was -- that's a reasonable assumption.

19 Q Where did Mr. Fleming get this document from?

20 A I do not know.

21 Q Did you ever ask him?

22 A No.

23 Q Is Mr. Fleming still an employee of Sundstrand?

24 A Yes.

25 Q Now, what did you say -- what did you mean by

96

24 (Pages 93 to 96)

ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES
(619) 233-0633 (800) 829-6159

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 this cover note that said you liked the plot on the
2 second-to-last page of the document Mr. Fleming sent
3 you?
4 A I thought it was a good representation of data.
5 Q In what sense?
6 A It was a clear portrayal of information.
7 Q And am I correct that your note on the first
8 page indicated that you thought Sundstrand should create
9 a comparable depiction for its 3200 APU?
10 A Yes.
11 MR. PUTNAM: Let's take our lunch break.
12 (Lunch recess taken from 12:15 p.m. to
13 1:25 p.m.)
14 MR. PUTNAM: Back on the record.
15 (Deposition Exhibit 13 marked.)
16 BY MR. PUTNAM:
17 Q Mr. Suttie, I've handed you what the court
18 reporter has marked as Suttie Deposition Exhibit No. 13
19 which is a three-page document with production numbers
20 HSB 215504 through 506. Do you have that document in
21 front of you?
22 A Yes.
23 Q And is that your handwriting near the bottom of
24 the page -- first page of Suttie Exhibit 13?
25 A Can you be more specific?

- 97

1 BY MR. PUTNAM:
2 Q Do you see here in the part written by
3 Mr. Tuquoi he says, "We don't see any reason to have a
4 different signal on the qual. APS 3000." Do you see
5 that?
6 A Yes, I see it.
7 Q Do you understand "qual." to be an abbreviation
8 for something there?
9 A Yes, I do.
10 Q What's that?
11 A Qualification.
12 Q What's the signal that's being talked about in
13 that sentence?
14 A I don't know.
15 Q It's the signal for measuring delta P, isn't
16 it?
17 A One could assume that.
18 Q Am I correct that Mr. Tuquoi's conclusion here
19 is that you should use for the APS 3000 the same delta P
20 measurement signal that is used on the Allied Signal
21 331-3507?
22 A Can you repeat that, please.
23 (Last question read.)
24 THE WITNESS: I don't know what Mr. Tuquoi's
25 conclusion was.

99

1 Q Do you see the word "Pete"?
2 A Yes.
3 Q Is that your name and your handwriting?
4 A Yes.
5 Q And does that show that you distributed this
6 memo to a number of members of the team who was working
7 with you on developing the APS 3200 in June 1992?
8 A Yes.
9 Q And this is a Coordination Memo -- the original
10 document here is a Coordination Memo written by
11 Mr. Tuquoi; is that right?
12 A Yes.
13 Q And what did this Coordination Memo relate to?
14 MR. MCCracken: objection. There's no
15 indication that he even remembers this document.
16 THE WITNESS: I don't recall.
17 BY MR. PUTNAM:
18 Q Okay. Can you look at it and tell me what the
19 memo relates to?
20 MR. MCCracken: Again, I object to the line of
21 the questioning. I'll make this one comment as a
22 general objection that it's not relevant to the issues
23 in the lawsuit.
24 THE WITNESS: The memo covers delta P
25 measurement.

98

1 BY MR. PUTNAM:
2 Q Well, taking a look at the memo, isn't that
3 what you understand by the memo here?
4 A One could assume that.
5 Q Did you ever discuss with Mr. Tuquoi this test
6 that he was conducting here on the Allied Signal
7 331-3507?
8 A I don't recall.
9 Q Do you remember why -- you see in the fourth
10 line he says, "No module where available before," fourth
11 line down?
12 A I see that line, yes.
13 Q Do you know why it was that Mr. Tuquoi had not
14 been able to test the Allied Signal APU before the date
15 of this document?
16 A I do not.
17 MR. PUTNAM: May I ask the court reporter to
18 mark this as Suttie Exhibit 14.
19 (Deposition Exhibit 14 marked.)
20 BY MR. PUTNAM:
21 Q Mr. Suttie, the court reporter has handed you
22 what's been marked as Suttie Exhibit 14 which is a
23 one-page Coordination Memo with production number
24 HSB 215503. Do you have that document in front of you?
25 A Exhibit No. 14?

100

25 (Pages 97 to 100)

ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES
(619) 233-0633 (800) 829-6159

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 Q Yes, sir.
2 A Yes.
3 Q Do you see in the bottom middle someone has
4 written in handwriting, "Assigned: Suttie"?
5 A I see that.
6 Q And this is a memo from Mr. Hardy, do you see
7 that?
8 A Yes.
9 Q Do you see the second sentence of the memo
10 says, "We already provided you with traces of
11 GTCP 331-350 (19 holes)"?
12 A Yes, I see that.
13 Q What is the 19 holes a reference to?
14 MR. MCCracken: Objection; no foundation laid
15 for this document.
16 THE WITNESS: I don't know.
17 BY MR. PUTNAM:
18 Q Can you think of anything related to APUs where
19 the phrase or fact of 19 holes might make sense?
20 A Yes.
21 Q What's that?
22 MR. MCCracken: Objection; speculation.
23 THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question?
24 (Record read.)
25 THE WITNESS: On the APS 3200, we have a

101

1 Q Am I correct that that was a test engine for
2 your development of the APS 3200?
3 A No.
4 Q What is the Q21?
5 A It was a qualification engine.
6 Q A qualification engine in the process of
7 developing the 3200, correct?
8 A No.
9 Q Okay. What kind of qualification was it?
10 A Not in developing the 3200. In qualifying the
11 3200.
12 Q Did the Q21 have a 19-vane diffuser?
13 A I don't recall.
14 Q Can you think of anything else that Mr. Hardy
15 might have meant by referring to the Q21 as having 19
16 holes?
17 A I can't think of anything else.
18 Q Now, when Mr. Hardy said he already provided
19 you with traces of the Allied Signal 331-350 diffuser,
20 is that the data that's contained in Exhibit 13 or is
21 that something different?
22 MR. MCCracken: Could you repeat the question,
23 please.
24 (Last question read.)
25 THE WITNESS: I don't know.

103

1 19-vane diffuser.
2 BY MR. PUTNAM:
3 Q What is a 19-vane diffuser?
4 A It's a diffuser with 19 vanes.
5 Q What's a diffuser?
6 A A diffuser is a piece of metal which takes high
7 velocity gas and converts that to lower velocity, higher
8 pressure.
9 Q And how does the diffuser used in the APS 3200
10 perform that function?
11 A Has 19 vanes, and as the air passes between
12 those vanes, the geometric shape of the vanes reduces
13 the velocity and increases pressure.
14 Q Where are those 19 vanes located in the
15 APU?
16 A At the exit of the load compressor.
17 Q And am I right that the Allied Signal 351-350
18 also has a 19-vane diffuser?
19 A I do not know.
20 Q Do you sometimes refer to the APS 3200's
21 19-vane diffuser as having 19 holes?
22 A No.
23 Q Okay. You see the reference in Exhibit 14 to
24 "our engine Q21"?
25 A Yes.

102

1 BY MR. PUTNAM:
2 Q Well, looking at the data that's attached to
3 Exhibit 13, can you tell me what that data shows or
4 reflects?
5 A No, I cannot.
6 Q And the fact that the first page of Exhibit 13
7 says, "The traces attached give the value of the static
8 pressure in the diffuser (average value of 19 holes),"
9 that doesn't give you a hint as to the data that's
10 attached in Exhibit 13?
11 A You asked me if I knew, not if I had a hint.
12 Q Do you have any understanding of whether the
13 data that's attached to Exhibit 13 is the data that's
14 referred to in Exhibit 14?
15 A I do not.
16 Q Must have been some lunch.
17 Let me ask this to be marked as Exhibit 15,
18 please.
19 (Deposition Exhibit 15 marked.)
20 MR. MCCracken: I object to counsel's last
21 comment on the record.
22 MR. PUTNAM: I object to the coaching that
23 obviously took place of this witness during lunch.
24 MR. MCCracken: There is no indication that
25 that has happened, and we resist any implication that

104

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 that is true.
2 BY MR. PUTNAM:
3 Q Mr. Suttie, I hand you Exhibit 15 which is a
4 one-page Coordination Memo dated October 8th, 1992 with
5 production number HSB 215491. Do you have that document
6 in front of you, sir?
7 A Yes.
8 Q And do you see that there is a cc to yourself
9 handwritten in the bottom middle of this document?
10 A Yes.
11 Q And do you see that Mr. Tuquoi -- and do you
12 see that this memo is also talking about addressing that
13 delta P/P issue that you were having in the 3200?
14 A Yes.
15 (Deposition Exhibit 16 marked.)
16 BY MR. PUTNAM:
17 Q Mr. Suttie, the court reporter has handed you
18 what's been marked as Suttie Deposition Exhibit No. 16
19 which is a one-page Coordination Memo dated February
20 2nd, 1993 with production number HSB 215454. Do you
21 have that document in front of you?
22 A 215454?
23 Q Yes, sir.
24 A Correct.
25 Q And do you see in the bottom middle of this

105

1 state?"
2 A When the required air flow from the aircraft
3 changes.
4 Q And is there a connection between the transient
5 band and the prevention of surge?
6 MR. MCCracken: Objection; ambiguous.
7 THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question,
8 please.
9 (Last question read.)
10 THE WITNESS: Yes.
11 BY MR. PUTNAM:
12 Q What's that connection?
13 A The surge occurs at a certain value of delta P
14 static on P static. The control is trying to maintain
15 surge-free operation and, as mentioned here, the
16 transient band is the delta between the two.
17 Q The delta between which two?
18 A Load compressor surge and the point at which
19 the control system is trying to maintain operation.
20 Q So is it fair to say the larger the transient
21 band is, the larger your margin of error is before you
22 get to surge?
23 MR. MCCracken: Objection; the question's
24 unclear.
25 THE WITNESS: Yes.

107

1 document is handwritten, "Assigned - Suttie"?
2 A Yes.
3 Q Can you tell me what this document is talking
4 about, sir?
5 A Would you like me to read it now and understand
6 it?
7 Q Sure.
8 A Can you repeat the question, please.
9 (Record read.)
10 THE WITNESS: It's talking about the control of
11 the load compressor.
12 BY MR. PUTNAM:
13 Q I see a phrase that appears a couple times that
14 says "transient band." Do you see that?
15 A Yes.
16 Q What does a transient band mean?
17 A It's the margin afforded in the control system
18 to allow for transient operation of the load compressor.
19 Q And what do you mean by "transient operation of
20 the load compressor"?
21 A Nonsteady state.
22 Q For example, situations where the load
23 compressor was quickly turned on and then turned off?
24 A No.
25 Q All right. Then what do you mean by "nonsteady

106

1 BY MR. PUTNAM:
2 Q Do you see, I think it's six lines down from
3 the top of this memo, there's a sentence that starts
4 near the right-hand margin with the words, "so the loss
5 of."
6 A Yes, I see that.
7 Q Can you read into the record the memo starting
8 with those words through the end of the page, please.
9 A "So the loss of surge margin due to transient
10 band would be 20%. For comparison on the GTC 331/350,
11 the transient band loss given by Garrett is only 5% on
12 surge margin. Around delta P/P approximately .2, this
13 loss corresponds to a 6% transient band on delta P/P
14 which is the target value because MES conditions."
15 Q What are MES conditions?
16 A MES.
17 Q What are MES conditions?
18 A Main engine start.
19 Q Was 6 percent transient band the target value
20 for Sundstrand?
21 A No.
22 Q Then what was the 6 percent transient band the
23 target for?
24 A It was Turbomeca's request.
25 Q So Turbomeca wanted Sundstrand, in its work on

108

27 (Pages 105 to 108)

ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES
(619) 233-0633 (800) 829-6159

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 its part of the 3200, to have a 6-percent transient
2 band; is that right?
3 A That's my understanding of this.
4 Q And am I right that at the time this memo was
5 written, Sundstrand's transient band was approximately
6 20 percent?
7 A Reading the memo, that's how I read the memo.
8 Q And am I right that what Turbomeca is saying to
9 you is that high of a transient band is not suitable for
10 main engine start conditions?
11 A No.
12 Q What is the phrase "not suitable for main
13 engine start conditions" right before the portion of the
14 memo that I just had you read, a reference to then?
15 A Can you repeat that, please.
16 (Last question read.)
17 THE WITNESS: I don't recall.
18 BY MR. PUTNAM:
19 Q And looking now, do you have any understanding,
20 sir, as to what that reference is?
21 A No.
22 Q As a designer of a control system for an APU,
23 would you strive to have a larger or smaller transient
24 band?
25 A One would strive for the smallest band

109

1 Page 62 of the document which has production number
2 HSA 96854.
3 A Page 62?
4 Q Yes, sir. Do you see the subheading near the
5 top of the page, "3.3.4.4 Closed Loop Load Compressor
6 BCV Control"?
7 A I do.
8 Q Am I correct that the text under that heading
9 describes the operation of the bleed control valve in
10 the APS 3200?
11 A Yes.
12 Q What does the phrase "closed loop" connote in
13 that heading?
14 A A control where a parameter is sensed and fed
15 back to a summing junction, thus making a closed loop.
16 Q What parameter or parameters are sensed and fed
17 back in operation of the APS 3200 bleed control valve?
18 A The parameter that is sensed are two: Delta
19 P/P, delta P static over P static, and also the bleed
20 control valve position.
21 Q And are both of those parameters then fed back
22 to a summing junction?
23 A Yes.
24 Q Am I correct from the first sentence under
25 3.3.4.4 on Page 62 of Exhibit 9 here that the electronic

111

1 possible.
2 Q Why is that?
3 A To minimize wasted performance.
4 Q In what sense does a larger band waste
5 performance?
6 A It would mean that more of the load compressor
7 air was being bypassed and not provided to the aircraft.
8 Q In other words, more of the air that's being
9 drawn in by the load compressor is being dumped out the
10 surge valve as opposed to being provided to the
11 aircraft, correct?
12 A Yes.
13 Q What is the transient band on the APS 3200 in
14 operation today?
15 A I don't know.
16 Q Approximately what?
17 A I don't know.
18 Q Is it less than 20 percent?
19 A I don't recall.
20 Q Am I right that you do know that it's not as
21 low as 5 percent?
22 A I don't recall.
23 Q Can you turn back to Suttie Exhibit 9, please,
24 which is the Revision N document that we were looking at
25 this morning. And let me direct your attention to

110

1 control box is to operate the bleed control valve to
2 maintain surge-free operation of the load compressor?
3 A What's the question?
4 MR. PUTNAM: Can you read it back, please.
5 (Last question read.)
6 THE WITNESS: Yes.
7 BY MR. PUTNAM:
8 Q How much flow rate do you need to bring in
9 through the load compressor to prevent surge?
10 A I don't know.
11 Q Am I right that in the APS 3200 you need to
12 bring in at least a certain level of air flow through
13 the load compressor in order to prevent surge?
14 A Yes.
15 Q And how is it that you determined how much air
16 you need to bring in through the load compressor to
17 prevent surge?
18 A We have a relationship between delta P static
19 divided by P static which corresponds to air flow.
20 Q And as long as that air flow and the delta
21 P/P relationship, that's something that you figured out
22 in the course of designing the 3200 bleed control valve
23 system, correct?
24 A No.
25 Q When did you determine that?

112

28 (Pages 109 to 112)

ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES
(619) 233-0633 (800) 829-6159

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 A It was provided by Turbomeca.
2 Q Okay. When did Turbomeca provide that?
3 A I don't recall.
4 Q Was it before you started working on the
5 APS 3000 which became the 3200?
6 A No, it was not.
7 Q We were looking at some memos from October
8 1992. Was it before October 1992?
9 A I don't recall.
10 Q Where did they get that relationship from?
11 A I don't know.
12 Q Did they get it from their experience on the
13 Allied Signal 331-350 APU?
14 A I don't know.
15 Q How is it that bringing a substantially
16 constant level of flow through the surge compressor --
17 I'm sorry, start over again.
18 How is it that bringing a substantially
19 constant level of air flow through the load compressor
20 prevents surge?
21 MR. MCCracken: Objection; it assumes a fact
22 not in evidence.
23 THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question.
24 (Last question read.)
25 MR. MCCracken: Further objection; ambiguous.

113

1 A The BCV does not accomplish that function.
2 Q What accomplishes that function in the
3 APS 3200?
4 A The inlet guide vanes.
5 Q How do the inlet guide vanes accomplish that
6 function?
7 A They move.
8 Q And what does that do?
9 A Allows more or less air into the load
10 compressor.
11 Q And am I right that the bleed control valve
12 allows you to get rid of excess air, where the load
13 compressor has brought in more than the aircraft needs
14 at that particular time?
15 A Yes.
16 Q And am I correct that if you didn't have a
17 functioning bleed control valve, there would be a risk
18 of surge at periods when you brought in more air through
19 the load compressor than the airline needed -- than the
20 airplane needed at that particular time?
21 A There would be a risk.
22 Q How many different settings does the bleed
23 control valve in the APS 3200 have?
24 A I need clarification of the question. Which
25 control system are you talking about? N?

115

1 THE WITNESS: I don't know.
2 BY MR. PUTNAM:
3 Q What do you mean, you don't know?
4 A That would be the information that a
5 performance engineer would be able to supply.
6 Q So is it your testimony that you know that that
7 does prevent surge, you're just not sure how it does
8 that; is that fair?
9 A Yes.
10 Q Am I right that the amount of air demanded by,
11 as you referred to it earlier, the customer changes
12 during operation of the APU?
13 A Yes.
14 Q In other words, sometimes the aircraft demands
15 more air or less air while the APS 3200 is in operation,
16 correct?
17 A Correct.
18 Q And am I correct that operation of the bleed
19 control valve in the APS 3200 is designed to insure that
20 you can meet that variable need for air while at the
21 same time preventing the occurrence of surge?
22 A Can you define what you mean by variable need
23 for air?
24 Q Sometimes the aircraft needs more air,
25 sometimes it needs less air.

114

1 Q The current APS 3200. How many different
2 settings does the bleed control valve have?
3 A The bleed control valve itself doesn't have
4 settings.
5 Q How many different locations can the bleed
6 control valve be in during operation of the APS 3200?
7 A An infinite number.
8 Q Okay. I take it in theory at least, the bleed
9 control valve could be all the way open during operation
10 of the APS 3200, correct?
11 A Yes.
12 Q And am I right, just so we have the terminology
13 right, that if it was all the way open, all of the air
14 would be being exhausted out and none would be going to
15 the airplane; is that correct?
16 A It's the reverse.
17 Q Okay. That's why I need to get the
18 terminology. If you were to hear the phrase "the bleed
19 control valve is all the way open," am I correct that
20 what you would understand by that is that all of the air
21 is going to the airplane and none of it is being dumped
22 out of the system, correct?
23 A Correct.
24 Q And am I right that it's also possible for the
25 bleed control valve to be all the way closed during

116

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 operation of the APS 3200?
2 A Yes.
3 Q And again, so we have the terminology, that
4 would mean none of the air is going to the aircraft and
5 all of it is being dumped off, correct?
6 A In the situation where the bleed control valve
7 is closed, the aircraft is not requiring pneumatic air.
8 Q Okay. And am I right from your earlier
9 testimony that there are an infinite number of
10 variations between all the way opened and all the way
11 closed of where the bleed control valve can be during
12 operation of the APS 3200?
13 A Yes.
14 Q Am I right from exhibit -- I'm sorry, Exhibit
15 9, Page 62, that Figures 12A to D of this document show
16 the control algorithms and logic for operation of the
17 bleed control valve?
18 A Yes.
19 Q Let me ask you please to turn to those diagrams
20 starting with Figure 12A on Page 128. Can you tell me
21 what Figure 12A shows, please?
22 A It shows the closed-loop PI surge control.
23 Q And what do the initials PI stand for in that
24 context?
25 A Proportional plus integral.

117

1 Q Okay.
2 MR. PUTNAM: why don't we -- off the record.
3 (Recess.)
4 MR. PUTNAM: Can you mark that as Exhibit 17,
5 please.
6 (Deposition Exhibit 17 marked.)
7 MR. PUTNAM:
8 Q Mr. Suttie, I've handed you what the court
9 reporter has marked as Exhibit Suttie 17 which you will
10 see is a stand-alone copy of Page 128 out of Exhibit 9
11 with production number HSA 96920. Do you have that in
12 front of you, sir?
13 A 96920, yes.
14 Q Okay. And would you agree with me that that's
15 also a -- a picture of Figure 12A out of Exhibit 9?
16 A Yes.
17 Q Let me give you a blue marker. Can you depict
18 on Exhibit 17 where the fact of measuring delta P/P
19 takes place in this logic diagram? And if you want to
20 draw a circle around part of the diagram or draw an
21 arrow towards part of the diagram, however you think
22 will be clearest, but I'd like you to label with a 1 the
23 measurement of delta P/P.
24 A Delta P/P itself is not measured as an
25 individual parameter.

118

1 Q Okay. Am I correct that the diagram shows
2 separate measurements of delta P and P?
3 A Correct.
4 Q And then the diagram shows a calculation where
5 delta P/P is calculated?
6 A Correct.
7 Q Okay. Can you depict with a 1 -- again, if you
8 want to draw an arrow to it or a box around it, however
9 you think is clearest -- the calculation of delta P/P as
10 it's depicted on Figure 12A.
11 Okay. Why don't you hang on to Exhibit 17.
12 I'm going to ask you to show some other things there.
13 Now, am I correct that the two inputs that are
14 sensed in the system that lead to that calculation,
15 there's a sensing of delta P and a sensing of P, is that
16 correct?
17 A Both static pressures, that's correct.
18 Q Okay. Where is the -- what's labeled here as
19 PS, do you see the reference to PS?
20 A Yes.
21 Q And that would be static pressure?
22 A Correct.
23 Q Where is that sensed in the APU?
24 A At the inlet to the bleed control valve.
25 Q Am I correct that in the APS 3200, there are --

119

1 or there is a duct between the outlet of the load
2 compressor and the inlet of the airplane?
3 A Yes.
4 Q And is the sensor for measuring PS or static
5 pressure, is that sensor somewhere in that duct?
6 A Yes.
7 Q Okay. Now, the reference that's labeled here
8 as DELP, do you see that on Exhibit 17?
9 A I do.
10 Q And that's what we've been referring to as
11 delta P, right?
12 A Delta P static, correct.
13 Q Okay. And where is that sensed in the
14 APS 3200?
15 A It's a delta pressure, so there are two sense
16 ports.
17 Q Okay. Where are the two places that it is
18 sensed?
19 A One is in the diffuser of the load compressor,
20 and the other is the PS we've been talking about.
21 Q So the delta P value uses both that same sensor
22 that we discussed earlier and a second sensor in the
23 diffuser of the load compressor, correct?
24 A No.
25 Q Okay. What's wrong about that statement?

120

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 A The PS is an individual sensor. The parameter
2 is sensed by an additional sensor which is a delta P
3 sensor.
4 Q Are there one sensor or two sensors that leads
5 to the delta P variable?
6 A One.
7 Q Where is that physically located?
8 A On the plenum of the APU.
9 Q Is that delta P sensor located in the duct
10 between the outlet of the compressor and the inlet of
11 the aircraft?
12 A Can you repeat the question, please.
13 (Last question read.)
14 THE WITNESS: No.
15 BY MR. PUTNAM:
16 Q Where is that sensor?
17 A It's on the plenum of the APU.
18 Q What is the plenum of the APU?
19 A The inlet.
20 Q On the inlet guide vanes?
21 A No, the inlet plenum.
22 Q Define the word "plenum" for me.
23 A Area, volume.
24 Q Where in the area of the APU is the delta P
25 sensor located?

121

1 Q The place where the air drawn in by the
2 compressor is exiting the compressor to go to the rest
3 of the system.
4 A I'm confused. I need to know what you mean by
5 "compressor" and "system."
6 Q Okay. Well, what does a compressor look like?
7 A That's a question?
8 Q Yes, sir.
9 A It's a round wheel made of metal.
10 Q And in the APS 3200, the compressor draws in
11 ambient air, correct?
12 A Yes.
13 Q And after ambient air is drawn in through the
14 compressor, the air travels through the diffuser,
15 correct?
16 A Correct.
17 Q And then the air travels to the bleed control
18 valve, correct?
19 A Yes.
20 Q And then it travels either to the airplane or
21 is dumped out, correct?
22 A Yes.
23 Q So the diffuser is in the duct from the
24 compressor -- start over again.
25 So the diffuser is in the duct between the

123

1 A On the outside surface.
2 Q Is the delta P sensor located downstream of the
3 inlet guide vanes?
4 A Can you define what you mean by "sensor"?
5 Q Well, as I understand your earlier testimony --
6 and maybe I'm mistaken -- as I understood your earlier
7 testimony, there is a physical sensor -- let me back up
8 and do it this way. Maybe I understand the confusion.
9 The delta P variable is an input into the logic
10 sequence shown on Figure 12A, correct?
11 A Correct.
12 Q How is that input generated?
13 A Two pressures are ducted to a sensor, and that
14 sensor measures the difference between the two
15 pressures.
16 Q Okay. Where are the two pressures themselves
17 measured to then be ducted to a sensor?
18 A One is the diffuser and the other is the BCV.
19 Q Okay. Is the diffuser where one of those two
20 measurements takes place in the duct between the outlet
21 of the compressor and the inlet of the airplane?
22 MR. MCCracken: objection; ambiguous.
23 THE WITNESS: What do you mean by "outlet of
24 the compressor"?
25 BY MR. PUTNAM:

122

1 compressor, that round metal wheel, and the airplane,
2 correct?
3 A It's between them, yes.
4 Q And there is a duct that runs between the
5 compressor and the airplane, correct, in the APS 3200?
6 A What do you mean by "duct"?
7 Q Well, what do you understand by the word
8 "duct"?
9 A To me it's a round tube.
10 Q Okay. Is there some sort of tube between the
11 compressor and the airplane through which the air
12 travels?
13 A No.
14 Q Are there a series of ducts between the
15 compressor and the airplane?
16 A There are a series of parts between the
17 compressor and the airplane.
18 Q And are those parts enclosed so that air that's
19 brought in through the compressor actually gets to the
20 airplane?
21 A Yes.
22 Q What's the difference between a series of
23 ducts, which was my question, and a series of parts,
24 which was your answer?
25 A I do not consider the diffuser to be a duct.

124

31 (Pages 121 to 124)

ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES
(619) 233-0633 (800) 829-6159

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 Q Okay. What does the diffuser look like?
2 A Can you clarify how I'm to answer that
3 question?
4 Q Well, I asked you earlier what a compressor
5 looked like and you told me a round metal wheel. That
6 was helpful. What does a diffuser look like? If we had
7 one on the table between us, what would we be looking
8 at?
9 A Another round piece of metal with a large hole
10 in the middle of it.
11 Q And this is the thing that in effect has 19
12 separate surfaces or holes --
13 A Yes.
14 Q -- in the APS 3200?
15 And are they separate surfaces -- are there 19
16 separate surfaces that the air travels past or through
17 as it goes through the diffuser?
18 A Yes.
19 Q And is there something that connects the outer
20 edges of the surfaces together?
21 MR. MCCracken: Objection; ambiguous.
22 THE WITNESS: Can you define what you mean by
23 "connects"?
24 BY MR. PUTNAM:
25 Q Sure. As I understand what your testimony is,

125

1 to draw the diffuser for the APS 3200 in hopes that we
2 can move forward on that basis.
3 THE WITNESS: Excuse my art.
4 Two views of the one part. It's a large
5 circular, like I mentioned, with a hole in the middle of
6 it. If you turn it around it would be like this. These
7 are considered diffuser vanes.
8 BY MR. PUTNAM:
9 Q And where does the -- where is the compressor
10 in relation to that?
11 And how much difference -- how much distance is
12 there between the compressor and the diffuser on the
13 APS 3200?
14 A I don't recall.
15 Q Is it less than an inch?
16 MR. MCCracken: Objection; it's ambiguous.
17 THE WITNESS: It's less than an inch.
18 BY MR. PUTNAM:
19 Q And what is it to prevent the air from just
20 going right through the middle of the diffuser as
21 opposed to touching any of the separate surfaces around
22 the diffuser?
23 A I don't understand the question.
24 Q Well, as you've drawn it and as I understand
25 it, the diffuser has a big hole in the middle of it,

127

1 the diffuser consists of 19 separate surfaces that the
2 air goes through, having been drawn in through the
3 compressor. And my question is, how are those surfaces
4 attached together so that the air, having gone through
5 surface No. 1, doesn't just escape out into the
6 atmosphere as opposed to going through surface No. 2?
7 A They don't follow that 1-2 path.
8 Q How do they work?
9 A The air goes through one path, and a different
10 set of air molecules will go through a different air
11 path.
12 Q But is the diffuser 19 separate surfaces that
13 the air goes through serially?
14 A No.
15 Q Let me hand you a sheet of yellow paper, and
16 can you please draw the diffuser for the APS 3200 so we
17 can have a common understanding of what this is?
18 MR. MCCracken: Counsel, you're asking him to
19 draw the diffuser to the best of his ability, or draw
20 the diffuser?
21 MR. PUTNAM: He's been describing in words what
22 the diffuser looks like. I have not been following
23 him. I'm not criticizing the witness, I just haven't
24 understood what he's saying. So in order to move things
25 along, I'm going to ask him to the best of his ability

126

1 correct?
2 A Yes.
3 MR. PUTNAM: Okay. Let me ask the court
4 reporter to label that drawing so we have it for the
5 record as Exhibit Suttie 18.
6 (Deposition Exhibit 18 marked.)
7 MR. MCCracken: We, of course, would request a
8 copy of Exhibit 18 as well as Exhibit 17.
9 MR. PUTNAM: We will provide you with one.
10 Q Turning you back to Exhibit 17, right under
11 the -- right under the delta P and P, there is a line
12 labeled SRGSPT. Do you see that, sir?
13 A I see it in two locations.
14 Q Okay. First of all, does that initial stand
15 for surge setpoint?
16 A Yes.
17 Q Okay. And do you see a graph in a shadow box
18 out of which comes a line that's labeled SRGSPT?
19 A Yes, I do.
20 Q And can you tell me what the surge setpoint as
21 depicted on Figure 12A represents?
22 A They're our desired delta P on P setpoint.
23 Q So the variable here, SRGSPT, is the desired
24 delta P/P value in the APS 3200; is that correct?
25 A Yes.

128

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 Q Okay. And am I right that the circle with the
2 plus and minus next to it just to the right of delta P/P
3 is referred to as a summing junction?

4 A Yes.

5 Q And am I right that at that summing junction,
6 what happens in the APS 3200 surge control system, that
7 the actual value of delta P/P is compared to the desired
8 value of delta P/P?

9 A Yes.

10 Q Can you please label with a 2 the place on
11 Exhibit 17 where the actual and desired values are
12 compared.

13 And the graph that sets forth the desired
14 value, is that the thing that you've said earlier was
15 supplied to you by Turbomeca during development of the
16 APS 3200?

17 A No.

18 Q How is that desired value graph generated?

19 A Empirically.

20 Q Okay. Were you involved in that empirical
21 testing?

22 (Mr. Miller left the deposition.)

23 THE WITNESS: I was involved with it, yes.

24 BY MR. PUTNAM:

25 Q Who was responsible for that empirical testing?

129

1 A No, you're not right.

2 Q What does the sampling frequency mean then?

3 A Every tenth -- every hundredth -- I apologize,
4 every hundredth of a second.

5 Q Let me state it again so that the testimony is
6 clear.

7 Am I correct that what this says is that every
8 100th of a second, the value of delta P and P is
9 measured and then fed into the system?

10 A Yes.

11 Q Okay. Let me take you down the path past the
12 summing junction. I see coming out of the summing
13 junction a variable that is labeled ERRSRG. Do you see
14 that?

15 A I do.

16 Q And is that an error signal?

17 A Yes.

18 Q And am I right that that error signal
19 represents the difference between the actual delta P/P
20 measurement and the desired delta P/P measurement?

21 A Yes.

22 Q And can you indicate with a 3 on Figure 17
23 where that error signal is.

24 Now, am I correct that the error signal that
25 you've just labeled with a 3 is then fed into -- is then

131

1 A The design engineer at the time.

2 Q And who was that?

3 A Ed Edelman.

4 Q Was he a Sundstrand employee or a Turbomeca
5 employee?

6 A Sundstrand employee.

7 Q Immediately above the desired value graph in
8 line with the delta P and P measurements, there are two
9 boxes that have the initials ZOH. Do you see that?

10 A Uh-huh.

11 Q What does ZOH stand for?

12 A Zero order hold.

13 Q What does that mean?

14 A It's a digital sampling of an analog parameter.

15 Q What's the purpose of doing that at that point
16 in the control logic?

17 A To measure the data.

18 Q Okay. And underneath each box I see "T=0.01
19 sec." Do you see that?

20 A Yes.

21 Q What does that mean?

22 A It's the sampling frequency.

23 Q So am I right that that means that every
24 hundredth of a second, the value of delta P and P is
25 measured and then fed into the system?

130

1 simultaneously fed into a proportional controller and an
2 integral controller?

3 A No.

4 Q What's wrong with that statement?

5 A You mentioned proportional plus integral. This
6 is proportional plus integral plus derivative.

7 Q Okay. Let me take it one at a time. Is that
8 error signal fed into a proportional controller?

9 A Yes.

10 Q Can you indicate with a 4 where the
11 proportional controller is depicted on Figure 12A.

12 A I don't recall.

13 Q What do you mean?

14 A I don't recall which of the two lines is the
15 appropriate one.

16 Q Well, which are the two possibilities that you
17 can't recall between?

18 A The one which is the initial box is
19 1 minus Z to the power negative 1 or the one marked
20 "TSAMP."

21 Q Am I right that one of those lines is the
22 proportional controller and the other line is the
23 integral controller?

24 A Yes.

25 Q And am I correct that your testimony is you're

132

33 (Pages 129 to 132).

ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES
(619) 233-0633 (800) 829-6159

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 just not sure as you sit here which is which?
2 A Yes.
3 Q Doesn't it make sense to you that the one in
4 the next set of boxes down the line which has P as the
5 second letter is the proportional and the one that has I
6 as the second letter is the integral one?
7 MR. MCCracken: Counsel, where are you
8 referring to? I don't see that.
9 I withdraw the question.
10 THE WITNESS: Yes, I could make that
11 assumption. However, it doesn't match with my
12 understanding of the meaning of those blocks.
13 BY MR. PUTNAM:
14 Q What's your understanding of the meaning of
15 those blocks?
16 A The 1 minus Z to the minus 1 as I remember is
17 an integral term.
18 Q Okay. Let me just do it this way: Am I right
19 that in the operation of the APS 3200, the error signal
20 that we've labeled as S-3 is fed to a proportional
21 controller? I know it's fed to other things, but I'm
22 taking one at a time. It's fed to a proportional
23 controller, right?
24 A Yes.
25 Q And am I right that that controller produces a

133

1 integral signals are summed, there is a command that
2 heads towards the bleed control valve?
3 A Can you define what "heads towards" means?
4 Q A command that leads to the bleed control
5 valve.
6 A Do you mean immediately leads towards or --
7 Q No, sir, eventually leads towards the bleed
8 control valve.
9 A In some circumstances, yes.
10 Q All right. Let me ask you -- put aside
11 Exhibit 17 for the time.
12 Let me ask the court reporter to mark a
13 stand-alone page of Figure 12B as Exhibit 19.
14 (Deposition Exhibit 19 marked.)
15 BY MR. PUTNAM:
16 Q Mr. Suttie, I've handed you what the court
17 reporter has marked as Suttie Exhibit 19 which is a
18 stand-alone copy of what is also Figure 12B in Suttie
19 Exhibit 9, has production number HSA 96921 on it. Do
20 you have Exhibit 19 in front of you, sir?
21 A Exhibit 19?
22 Q Yes, sir.
23 A Yes.
24 Q Now, am I correct that the output of the
25 control logic shown on Figure 12A is depicted on

135

1 signal proportionally related to the error signal?
2 A Yes.
3 Q And am I right that the error signal is also
4 fed to an integral controller?
5 A Yes.
6 Q And am I right that that integral controller
7 produces a signal that is integrally related as a
8 function of time to the error signal?
9 A What do you mean by "as a function of time"?
10 Q Let me ask it this way: That integral
11 controller produces a signal that is integrally related
12 to the error signal?
13 A Yes.
14 Q And am I right that as depicted in Figure 12A,
15 the integral signal and the proportional signal are then
16 summed?
17 A Yes.
18 Q Can you label with a 6 the place on Figure 17
19 where the proportional and integral signals are summed?
20 MR. MCCracken: Skipping 5, Counsel? Or was
21 that intentional?
22 MR. PUTNAM: I'm skipping 4 and 5, yes.
23 MR. MCCracken: 4 and 5.
24 BY MR. PUTNAM:
25 Q And am I right that after the proportional and

134

1 Figure 12B as well?
2 A Can you repeat the question, please.
3 MR. PUTNAM: Ask the court reporter to read it
4 back.
5 (Last question read.)
6 THE WITNESS: Could you define what you mean by
7 the output of 12A?
8 BY MR. PUTNAM:
9 Q Well, 12A shows a series of calculations and
10 shows a particular signal exiting on the far right-hand
11 side of Figure 12A, correct?
12 A Can you name it?
13 Q Am I correct that Figure 12A shows a signal
14 exiting the logic shown on 12A on the far right-hand
15 side?
16 A Yes.
17 Q And is that signal also depicted at the top of
18 Figure 12B?
19 A No, it is not.
20 Q Okay. What does Figure 12B show?
21 A It shows the surge control choked flow
22 compensation logic.
23 Q What does the phrase "choked flow compensation
24 logic" mean?
25 A Can you define your question better?

136

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 Q I'm just using, sir, the phrase that's on
2 Figure 12B. I want to know what you understand by the
3 phrase "choked flow compensation logic."
4 A It's logic used to determine the status of the
5 load compressor.
6 Q Is that your full answer?
7 A Yes.
8 Q What does the phrase "choked flow" mean, or
9 connote?
10 A Choked flow is a thermodynamic phenomena which
11 occurs in gas dynamics.
12 Q And is it a situation where too much air is
13 being brought in?
14 A No.
15 Q Is it a situation where not enough air is being
16 brought in?
17 A No.
18 Q What does it mean then, a choked flow?
19 A It's an aerodynamic function as a result of air
20 passing down the duct in various flows and temperatures.
21 Q Is choked flow good or bad?
22 A It is neither good nor bad.
23 Q Am I right that Figure 12B shows that as part
24 of the surge control on the APS 3200, you measure the
25 position of the inlet guide vanes?

137

1 Q And am I correct that Figure 12B is among the
2 figures that was referenced in that portion on Page 62?
3 A Yes.
4 Q Okay. Am I correct that Figure 12B shows that
5 as a portion of the bleed control valve logic for the
6 APS 3200, you measure the position of the inlet guide
7 vanes?
8 A Can you repeat that, please.
9 (Last question read.)
10 THE WITNESS: This figure shows the bleed
11 select uses IGV position.
12 BY MR. PUTNAM:
13 Q Okay. And that's part of the logic of
14 controlling the bleed control valve in the APS 3200,
15 correct? It is an input into that control system,
16 correct?
17 MR. MCCracken: Objection; there's two
18 questions that's been posed.
19 BY MR. PUTNAM:
20 Q Bleed control valve position is an input into
21 the control system that controls the bleed control valve
22 in the APS 3200, correct?
23 A No.
24 Q What's wrong with that statement?
25 A You said "bleed control valve position."

139

1 A Can you define what you mean by "part of the
2 surge control"?
3 Q Figure 12B shows a portion of the logic by
4 which the APS 3200 bleed control valve is operated,
5 correct?
6 A Can you repeat that, please.
7 (Last question read.)
8 THE WITNESS: It shows a portion of the logic.
9 BY MR. PUTNAM:
10 Q For operation of the bleed control valve in the
11 APS 3200, correct?
12 A Can you define what you mean by "operation of
13 the bleed control valve" just so I'm clear.
14 Q Sir, can you turn back to Page 62 of Suttie
15 Exhibit 9; because I'm just -- we did this before. I
16 don't think this is rocket science. Look at Page 62 of
17 Exhibit 9.
18 Do you have that in front of you, sir?
19 A Yeah.
20 Q Do you see the second sentence under the
21 heading we looked at earlier, 3.3.4.4, it says, "The ECS
22 shall operate the modulating bleed control valve," and
23 then skipping a couple words, "The control algorithms
24 and logic are specified in Figures 12A through 12D"?
25 A Yes.

138

1 Q Inlet guide vane position is an input into the
2 control system that controls the bleed control valve in
3 the APS 3200, correct?
4 A No. The bleed control valve is not controlled
5 directly with IGV position.
6 Q Sir, that wasn't my question. My question is,
7 am I correct that inlet guide vane position is an input
8 into the control system that controls the bleed control
9 valve in the APS 3200?
10 MR. MCCracken: Is that a question, Counsel?
11 MR. PUTNAM: Yes.
12 THE WITNESS: The answer is yes.
13 BY MR. PUTNAM:
14 Q Okay. In what way does inlet guide vane
15 position affect operation of the bleed control valve in
16 the APS 3200?
17 MR. MCCracken: Could you reread the question,
18 please.
19 (Last question read.)
20 MR. MCCracken: Objection; assumes a fact not
21 in evidence.
22 THE WITNESS: IGV position is used to compute a
23 critical pressure ratio.
24 BY MR. PUTNAM:
25 Q And what's the critical pressure ratio?

140

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 A P7 over P2.
2 Q What's the purpose of computing that ratio?
3 A To determine the pressure ratio across the --
4 I'm sorry. A critical pressure ratio across the load
5 compressor.
6 Q And what do you do with that calculation?
7 A It is compared with a measured pressure ratio.
8 Q And what do you do with that comparison?
9 A The comparison is fed into an and gate.
10 Q To a what?
11 A An and gate.
12 Q An and gate?
13 A Yes.
14 Q And what happens then?
15 A The output of the -- discrete output of the and
16 gate may or may not change state.
17 Q I'm sorry? The discrete output of the and gate
18 may or may not change state?
19 A Correct.
20 Q What does that mean?
21 A As a result of the input to an and gate, the
22 and gate receives information from another like, and
23 gate is the digital discrete device. Its output is
24 either zero or 1. Change state means go from zero to 1
25 or vice versa.

141

1 the measurement of inlet guide vane position is used in
2 Figure 12B. Am I right that one of them feeds directly
3 into the and gate you've labeled with an 8 and the other
4 is used in some processing steps that eventually leads
5 to that same and gate?
6 A No.
7 Q What's wrong with my statement?
8 A The block labeled "less than 20%" is where the
9 IGV position is fed into.
10 Q Okay. And that then leads to the and gate,
11 correct?
12 A That leads to the and gate, but at that point
13 it's a discrete value.
14 Q It's a discrete what?
15 A Discrete value.
16 Q Okay. And what happens after the and gate that
17 you've labeled as No. 8 on the logic shown in 12B?
18 A It leads to an or gate.
19 Q Okay. Can you label the or gate with a 9.
20 And what is the function of the or gate that
21 you have labeled with a 9 on Exhibit 19 which is
22 Figure 12B?
23 A The function of an or gate is to take inputs
24 and create an output as a function of the inputs.
25 Q Okay. And am I correct that the two potential

143

1 Q Okay. Let me do it this way: Can you label
2 with a 7 the place on Figure 12B in Exhibit Suttie 19
3 where inlet guide vane position is measured, the place
4 which shows the measurement of inlet guide vane
5 position.
6 Is inlet guide vane position measured -- or the
7 measurement shown twice on Exhibit 12B, correct?
8 A Yes.
9 Q And is that the same measurement?
10 A Yes.
11 Q Why is it measured twice?
12 A It's not measured twice.
13 Q Why is it used in two different parts of the
14 12B logic?
15 A I'm sorry, I don't understand how to answer the
16 question.
17 Q All right. Let me take it one step at a time.
18 Can you label with a 7 both places where the
19 measurement of inlet guide vane position is depicted on
20 Figure 12B.
21 Okay. Can you label with an 8 the and gate
22 into which that position is fed.
23 A Okay. Only one of those feeds directly into
24 the and gate.
25 Q Okay. We've said there are two places where

142

1 outputs of the or gate at the top right of Figure 12B
2 are zero or 1?
3 A I'm sorry, repeat that.
4 MR. PUTNAM: Can you repeat the question,
5 please.
6 (Last question read.)
7 THE WITNESS: Yes.
8 BY MR. PUTNAM:
9 Q Now, I see in parentheses it says
10 "0-low flow" and "1-high flow." Do you see that?
11 A Yes.
12 Q What does that mean?
13 A It's reference information in parentheses.
14 Q Okay. What does low flow mean in that context?
15 A Flow which is not a high flow.
16 Q What does high flow mean?
17 A The reciprocal. These do not have any values
18 to them.
19 Q Okay. For operation of the bleed control valve
20 in the APS 3200, what is the implication of a zero
21 coming out of the top right of Figure 12B as opposed to
22 a 1 coming out of the top right of Figure 12B?
23 A The significance is a selection of whether the
24 parameter termed BCCTL is used or ignored.
25 Q In operation of the bleed control valve,

144

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 correct?
2 A Yes.
3 Q Under what circumstances is the parameter
4 BCVCTL used in operation of the bleed control valve?
5 A When BLDSEL is zero.
6 Q And what happens when BLDSEL is 1?
7 A BCVCTL is ignored.
8 Q And does not play a role in operating the bleed
9 control valve, correct?
10 A At that time the bleed control valve is a fixed
11 position.
12 Q What fixed position?
13 A Full open.
14 Q Full open? And in the terminology we had
15 before, full open meant all of the air was going to the
16 aircraft and none was being dumped out, correct?
17 A Correct.
18 Q Okay. So as I understand --
19 A Can we take a break? I'm feeling quite tired.
20 MR. PUTNAM: Sure.
21 MR. MCCracken: Before we go off the record, I
22 would like to just make it known that Mr. Suttie has a
23 prior engagement this evening that requires him to leave
24 at 5:15.
25 MR. PUTNAM: At 5 --

145

1 be full open?
2 A When the aircraft is requesting air to be
3 delivered and that the aircraft was in a position to
4 receive all the air that they were requesting.
5 MR. PUTNAM: Let me ask the court reporter to
6 mark as Exhibit Suttie 20, Figure 12C.
7 (Deposition Exhibit 20 marked.)
8 BY MR. PUTNAM:
9 Q Mr. Suttie, I have handed you what's been
10 marked as Suttie Exhibit No. 20 which is Figure 12C from
11 Suttie Exhibit 9, and it has production number
12 HSA 96922. Do you have Exhibit 20 in front of you, sir?
13 A Yes.
14 Q Am I right that Figure 12C, among other things,
15 shows how the outputs of Figures 12A and 12B interact to
16 affect the operation of the bleed control valve?
17 A This figure shows how these inputs from 12A and
18 12B affect BCVCMD.
19 Q And is that, the BCVCMD, the command that opens
20 or closes the bleed control valve?
21 A Yes.
22 Q And the schematic shown in Exhibit 20 is the
23 bleed control valve itself? Would it be to the right of
24 where it says BCVCMD?
25 A Yes.

147

1 MR. MCCracken: 5:15.
2 MR. PUTNAM: Okay. You haven't told me that
3 before, but I'm certainly not going to start a pattern
4 of inconveniencing the witnesses, so I'm happy to stop
5 then. I can tell you I'm not going to be done with
6 Mr. Suttie.
7 MR. MCCracken: We appreciate that.
8 MR. PUTNAM: I suggest we may want to talk off
9 the record about when we're going to continue his
10 deposition.
11 MR. MCCracken: Yes, and I believe that he has
12 to check his schedule. We anticipated this possibility,
13 and he needs to go back and discuss his schedule and
14 discuss matters with his wife about that. So we can let
15 you know possibly as early as tomorrow when that could
16 be done.
17 MR. PUTNAM: Okay. Could we go off the record
18 and discuss this further?
19 MR. MCCracken: Certainly.
20 (Recess.)
21 BY MR. PUTNAM:
22 Q Let me step back a little from the specifics of
23 the diagrams.
24 Under what circumstances in the operation of
25 the A320 would you want the bleed control valve to

146

1 Q Can you draw a box on Suttie Exhibit 20 to
2 depict the actual bleed control valve in the right place
3 in the logical sequence of what's shown here.
4 And can you label that box "bleed control
5 valve."
6 Now, I notice on Exhibit 20 you did not draw
7 that box as connected to the line that's labeled
8 BCVCMD. Is there any particular reason you didn't draw
9 the box as connected to that line?
10 A Yes.
11 Q What's that?
12 A There's hardware circuitry in between.
13 Q So am I right that the signal BCVCMD travels
14 through various hardware circuitry, I guess to the
15 electronic control box, and then circuitry travels to
16 the actual valve to tell it to open or close?
17 A Yes.
18 Q Let me ask you to turn back to Figure 17 which
19 was Figure 12A. Do you have that one in front of you?
20 I'm sorry, Exhibit Suttie 17 which was Figure 12A. Do
21 you have that in front of you?
22 A Yes.
23 Q And this shows that the output of this
24 control -- this control logic shown in this Figure is a
25 variable labeled BCVCTL, correct?

148

37 (Pages 145 to 148)

ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES
(619) 233-0633 (800) 829-6159

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL. 1
06/14/00

1 A Yes.
2 Q And does that stand for bleed control valve
3 control?
4 A Yes.
5 Q And am I correct that Figure 12A shows that
6 BCVCTL is calculated based on the sum of the
7 proportional and integral control signals as summed in
8 the device I earlier had you label as No. 6?
9 A No.
10 Q Am I correct that Figure 12A shows that the
11 BCVCTL signal is calculated based on the sum of the
12 proportional and integral control signals with a couple
13 of other factors added in?
14 A With two additional factors.
15 Q Okay. What are those two additional factors?
16 A A derivative control term.
17 Q And that's the thing that's coming up from the
18 bottom of the large box on Figure 12A; is that correct?
19 A Correct.
20 Q And what's the other factor?
21 A I don't recall.
22 Q Okay. And am I right that the sum of the
23 proportional-integral controls is then summed to those
24 two other factors?
25 A Can you clarify exactly what you mean by "sum

149

1 of the proportional-integral controls?"
2 Q I think we established in earlier testimony
3 that the proportional-integral controls are summed at a
4 summing junction that you labeled as No. 6, correct?
5 A The sum of the proportional control times the
6 error plus the integral control times the error are
7 summed at 6.
8 Q Well, you said earlier that the proportional
9 controller produced a signal that was proportionally
10 related to the error signal, correct?
11 A Yes.
12 Q Okay. And that the integral controller
13 produced a signal that was integrally related to the
14 error signal, correct?
15 A Yes.
16 Q And that proportionally related signal and the
17 integrally related signal are summed at the summing
18 junction you've labeled as No. 6, correct?
19 A Correct.
20 Q And that summing junction produces a value,
21 correct?
22 A Correct.
23 Q Okay. Do you know what units that value is
24 expressed in?
25 A I don't know.

150

1 Q Okay. That value is then summed together with
2 two other values at the summing junction that is
3 immediately to the right of the one you've labeled
4 No. 6, correct?
5 A Correct.
6 Q And it is out of that second summing junction
7 that the variable BCVCTL is generated, correct?
8 A Correct.
9 Q Am I correct that the value of BCVCTL is
10 directly a function of the value generated by summing
11 junction No. 6?
12 A Can you define what you mean by "a function
13 of"?
14 Q Well, as the value produced by summing junction
15 No. 6 goes up, so does BCVCTL go up, and similarly, as
16 that value goes down, so does BCVCTL go down, correct?
17 A I don't know.
18 Q Why don't you know that?
19 A Because I need to know the value of LDOES2.
20 Q Well, the second summing junction shows that
21 all three of those values are added together, correct?
22 A Correct.
23 Q And that's what produces BCVCTL, correct?
24 A Correct.
25 Q So isn't it correct that as any one of those

151

1 three inputs goes up or down, the value of BCVCTL
2 similarly will vary up or down?
3 A They could compensate each other.
4 Q What do you mean by "they could compensate each
5 other"?
6 A One can go up and the other one could
7 simultaneously go down.
8 Q Holding the other factors equal, as the value
9 produced by summing junction 6 goes up or down, the
10 value of BCVCTL will go up or down accordingly, correct?
11 A Correct.
12 MR. PUTNAM: May I have this marked as
13 Exhibit 21.
14 (Deposition Exhibit 21 marked.)
15 BY MR. PUTNAM:
16 Q Mr. Suttie, I've handed you what's been marked
17 as Suttie Exhibit No. 20. And first of all, let me
18 explain for your benefit and for the record what this
19 is.
20 I've taken Page 118 of Suttie Exhibit 9, which
21 is labeled Control System Overview, and has three
22 overview diagrams, one for fuel control, one for BCV
23 control and one for IGV control. Because the BCV
24 control was fairly small there, I have blown up that
25 portion of Figure 8 from Suttie Exhibit 9, which is

152

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 HSA 96910, to what is now in front of you as Suttie
2 Exhibit 20. So Suttie Exhibit 20 is an excerpt -- I'm
3 sorry, Suttie Exhibit 21. So Suttie Exhibit 21 is an
4 excerpt from one of the figures found in Suttie Exhibit
5 9. Do you understand that?
6 A Yes. Can you repeat which figure number it
7 was?
8 Q Sure, Figure 8 on Page 118 is what this is an
9 excerpt from. Do you see that?
10 A Yes.
11 Q Okay. Now, am I correct that the top left box
12 on Exhibit 21 is a depiction of Figure 12A which we
13 looked at earlier as Exhibit 17?
14 A Yes.
15 Q And that box shows the various inputs that
16 Figure 12A uses and then the output that Figure 12A
17 produces, correct?
18 A I need to check it one for one, but that's the
19 intent.
20 Q Go ahead and check it, because I think it's not
21 only the intent but is in fact what is shown.
22 A Yes.
23 Q Okay. And am I correct that the box
24 immediately under the Figure 12A box on Exhibit 21 is a
25 summary of the processing that is performed in Figure

153

1 Q And how is it used in sequencing logic?
2 A When the aircraft requires pneumatic air for
3 the first time, we go through a sequence to open valves
4 and supply the air. We need to do the sequence one
5 activity after another.
6 Q Okay. Does Figure 12C only affect that period
7 of initial start-up of the airplane?
8 A No.
9 Q All right. Let me see if I can -- first of
10 all, would you agree with me that the intent of the
11 summary chart that I have shown here on Exhibit 21 from
12 your diagram is to show a summary of the overall logic
13 for the control of the bleed control valve on the
14 APS 3200?
15 MR. MCCracken: Objection, if you're relating
16 the question to your intent. Leave it at that.
17 MR. PUTNAM: Well, it's a diagram that's in his
18 documents, in the Sundstrand documents.
19 Q Am I correct that the intent of this diagram in
20 the Sundstrand document is to show an overview of the
21 control logic that is used to control the bleed control
22 valve of the APS 3200?
23 A It's a high-level overview.
24 Q Of that control logic, correct?
25 A Yes.

155

1 12B, what we looked at previously as Suttie Exhibit 197
2 A No.
3 Q What's incorrect about that?
4 A Figure 12B shows an input of DELPOP which is
5 not shown here.
6 Q Okay. But for that, am I correct that the box
7 that's labeled 12B on Exhibit 21 shows all of the other
8 inputs that come into Figure 12B and it shows the one
9 output that comes out of Figure 12B?
10 A With that exception, yes.
11 Q Okay. Now, staying on Exhibit 21, do you see
12 that there are a series of arrows that are shown as
13 going into Figure 12C?
14 A Yes.
15 Q And one of those is the output from Figure 12A,
16 correct?
17 A Correct.
18 Q And one is the output from Figure 12B, correct?
19 A Correct.
20 Q And am I correct that another one of the inputs
21 that goes into Figure 12C is inlet guide vane position?
22 A Correct.
23 Q How is inlet guide vane position being used as
24 a separate input into Figure 12C?
25 A It's used in sequencing logic.

154

1 Q Okay. Let me see if I understand how these
2 various parts of the logic fit together.
3 Figure 12A produces a variable called BCCTL,
4 correct?
5 A Correct.
6 Q Figure 12B then produces or at the same time is
7 producing a variable called BLDSEL, correct?
8 A Correct.
9 Q And if BLDSEL is zero, then it is BCCTL that
10 goes and controls operation of the bleed control valve,
11 correct?
12 A No.
13 Q Have I got that backwards? Sorry.
14 A No.
15 Q Okay. What's wrong with my statement then?
16 A There are multiple other points at which the
17 bleed control valve can be moved.
18 Q Based on other factors, correct?
19 A Yes.
20 Q Okay. Can you turn back to -- keep Exhibit 21
21 in front of you and take a look again at Exhibit 20
22 which is the blowup of Figure 12C. Do you have that in
23 front of you?
24 A Yes.
25 Q All right. Now, Figures 12A and 12B are both

156

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 shown on sort of the bottom line of Figure 12C, correct?
2 A Correct.
3 Q All right. And I'm going to draw an arrow to a
4 portion of figure -- of Suttie Exhibit 20. See where
5 I've drawn an arrow to? You see that, sir?
6 A I do.
7 Q Okay. Am I right that that's a -- that arrow
8 is pointing to a line that in the logic sequence shows a
9 particular value being transmitted through the system?
10 A Yes.
11 Q Okay. And that -- where I pointed the arrow,
12 the logic has taken into account the outputs of both 12A
13 and 12B, correct?
14 A Yes.
15 Q Okay. And if the BLDSEL variable produced from
16 12B is zero, then the value where I've put the arrow is
17 whatever the value coming out of Figure 12A was,
18 correct?
19 A Correct.
20 Q And what is the value at the place where I put
21 the arrow if BLDSEL was 1?
22 A KSRGMX.
23 Q Okay. And if the value where I put the arrow
24 is KSRGMX, does that automatically mean that the bleed
25 control valve is going to be full open when it receives

157

1 the bleed control valve to go full open?
2 A Yes.
3 Q What?
4 A The sequencing logic could be commanded to move
5 the BCV.
6 Q So is it fair to say that the output of
7 Figure 12B will determine what the signal is at the
8 place I put the arrow in the control logic on Exhibit
9 20, but whether the output has told the signal at that
10 point to pay attention to Figure 12A or to go full open,
11 either way, things can happen subsequently in the
12 control logic to affect operation of the bleed control
13 valve?
14 MR. MCCracken: Objection; the question can't
15 be understood.
16 THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question,
17 please.
18 MR. PUTNAM: Let me ask the court reporter to
19 read it back.
20 (Last question read.)
21 THE WITNESS: Can you rephrase the question,
22 please?
23 BY MR. PUTNAM:
24 Q No. I mean, I understand it's a long question,
25 but there's a lot of different steps involved here. Can

159

1 that signal?
2 A No.
3 Q Okay. I thought you said earlier that when
4 bleed select was 1, that meant the valve was full open.
5 was that not right or did I mishear you?
6 A There's -- as I understood your question, when
7 the blue arrow equals KSRGMX does not immediately mean
8 the BCV will be full open.
9 Q Well, but is there anything that can happen to
10 the control signal before it gets to the bleed control
11 valve that could produce a result other than the bleed
12 control valve being full open?
13 A Yes.
14 Q And what sorts of things could happen?
15 A Positive rate limit.
16 Q What's a positive rate limit?
17 A It's a device intended to prevent the BCV
18 moving too quickly.
19 Q So the signal where I have the arrow might be
20 telling it, go full open, but the positive rate limit
21 might modulate or affect that signal before it gets to
22 the bleed control valve; is that right?
23 A Yes.
24 Q Might anything else happen that would prevent
25 that signal, assuming bleed select was 1, from telling

158

1 you answer the question I've asked?
2 A I'm not sure what the question is.
3 Q Let me get at it this way: Let me ask you to
4 turn back to Suttie Exhibit 19, Figure 12B. Am I
5 correct that holding other factors equal, the inlet
6 guide vane position will affect the calculation of the
7 BLDSEL variable from Figure 12B?
8 A No.
9 Q What's wrong with that?
10 A If delta -- DELPQP exceeds .35, movement of the
11 IGVS will not have any effect on BLDSEL.
12 Q Okay. And if delta P/P exceeds .35, would that
13 happen in normal operation or would that be an unusual
14 value for delta P/P?
15 A That would be normal operation.
16 Q Okay. Am I correct that in Figure 12B, when
17 delta P/P is not greater than .35, the position of the
18 inlet guide vanes will affect the value of BLDSEL?
19 A Yes.
20 Q And am I correct, looking at Suttie Exhibit 20,
21 Figure 12C, that the value of BLDSEL will affect whether
22 BCVCTL plays any role in operation of the bleed control
23 valve?
24 A Can you repeat that, please.
25 (Last question read.)

160

40 (Pages 157 to 160)

ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES
(619) 233-0633 (800) 829-6159

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 THE WITNESS: Yes.
2 BY MR. PUTNAM:
3 Q Okay. Figure 12C is labeled "BCV Altitude
4 Lock-out, Authority Limit, Rate Limit and Sequencing
5 Logic." Do you see that?
6 A Which exhibit?
7 Q Exhibit Suttie 20, Figure 12C.
8 A Can you repeat?
9 Q Sure. Do you see at the bottom where it says
10 12C, it includes altitude lock-out, authority limit,
11 rate limit and sequencing logic?
12 A Yes.
13 Q Am I right from your earlier testimony that
14 sequencing logic relates to the very initial start-up of
15 the APU?
16 A No.
17 Q Okay. What does sequencing logic as it's used
18 in Figure 12C refer to?
19 A It's sequencing on and sequencing off.
20 Q Okay. So it's the sequencing at the very
21 initial start-up and the very end power-down of the APU?
22 A No.
23 Q All right. Just tell me what sequencing logic
24 means then.
25 A When bleed is commanded on and bleed is

161

1 in Figure 12C?
2 A Per customer requirements specification,
3 pneumatic supply is not required above a certain
4 altitude. This logic insures that the APU does not
5 provide bleed air above a certain altitude.
6 Q And can you indicate with the number 9 where
7 the authority limit logic is depicted on Figure 12C.
8 Okay. And is altitude lock-out something
9 different than authority limit, as it's used in the
10 caption of Figure 12C?
11 A I don't know.
12 Q Well, do you understand altitude lock-out to be
13 the same as what you just described as authority limit?
14 A As I understand it.
15 Q As you understand it, yes, it is the same?
16 A Yes.
17 MR. PUTNAM: Mark that as Exhibit 22.
18 (Deposition Exhibit 22 marked.)
19 MR. MCCracken: Do you have a copy for us?
20 MR. PUTNAM: I'm sorry, I do.
21 Q Mr. Suttie, the court reporter has just handed
22 you what's been marked as Suttie Exhibit No. 22 which is
23 a document with production numbers HSA 176194 through
24 176216. Do you have that document in front of you?
25 A 176216.

163

1 commanded off.
2 Q When you say "bleed is commanded on or off,"
3 you mean the bleed control valve is commanded to start
4 moving and stop moving?
5 A No, I mean the signal from the aircraft
6 requesting pneumatic air.
7 Q Okay. During normal operation of the APU, will
8 the aircraft continuously start and stop asking for
9 pneumatic air or will it be a continuous request for
10 pneumatic air, albeit at different volumes?
11 A Under normal circumstances, it would be -- air
12 would be supplied most of the time.
13 Q Continuously?
14 A Not necessarily.
15 Q Okay. And the sequencing logic affects the
16 operation of the bleed control valve at the very start
17 of the request for pneumatic air and at the very end of
18 such a request, correct?
19 A Correct.
20 Q The rate limit that is referred to in
21 Figure 12C, I think you said earlier, affects whether
22 the bleed control valve is being told to open or close
23 too rapidly; is that correct?
24 A Yes.
25 Q Okay. What does the authority limit refer to

162

1 Q Yes, sir. Do you have the document in front of
2 you?
3 A Yes.
4 Q Okay. Do you see that the first two pages
5 appear to be a handwritten memo for a control systems
6 meeting in March 1990?
7 A Yes.
8 Q And do you see that you are listed as the
9 presenter of systems and controls prior experience in
10 the morning of that meeting?
11 A Yes.
12 Q Do you recall the meeting that's referenced
13 here?
14 A No.
15 Q Do you recall in or about March 1990 a meeting
16 between Sundstrand and Turbomeca to discuss the control
17 system for the APS 3000?
18 A Vaguely.
19 Q Okay. Can you look at the pages that follow
20 the agenda in Suttie Exhibit 22 and tell me what those
21 pages generally depict.
22 A Page 176196 was a system schematic. Page
23 176197 is an ECB input/output diagram. 176198 is a
24 schematic of a proposed control system.
25 Q Let me stop you on 176198. Was this the

164

41 (Pages 161 to 164)

ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES
(619) 233-0633 (800) 829-6159

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 control system that was proposed for the APS 3000 as of
2 March 1990?
3 A Yes.
4 Q And if you look at the top middle of the page
5 in the orientation that you have it, do you see there is
6 a box that says "P-I Controller"?
7 A Yes.
8 Q And is that a reference to a
9 proportional-integral controller?
10 A Yes.
11 Q And in the system that's proposed here, am I
12 correct that that controller would have issued a surge
13 valve command leading towards the, what was called here,
14 anti-surge valve?
15 MR. MCCracken: Objection. There is a number
16 of PI controllers on the drawing.
17 MR. PUTNAM: Yeah, but I'm referring to a
18 specific one that I particularly pointed the witness to.
19 Q Is my statement correct, sir?
20 A Yes.
21 Q And do you see to the left of that particular
22 PI controller, there is a summing junction?
23 A Yes.
24 Q And do you see that that summing junction would
25 be comparing an actual measurement of delta P/P to a

165

1 A Can you define what you mean by "as a function
2 of"?
3 Q Do you see that there is a setpoint table in
4 the top center of this figure?
5 A Yes.
6 Q And do you see that one of the arrows coming
7 into that setpoint figure is labeled IGV?
8 A I do.
9 Q In the system proposed here in this figure, why
10 was IGV going into the setpoint table?
11 A It was thought at the time that delta P/P
12 setpoint was a function of IGVs. That turned out not to
13 be the case.
14 Q When you say "it was thought at the time that
15 delta P/P setpoint was a function of IGV," what did you
16 mean by that?
17 A That we believed that the delta P/P setpoint
18 would be a function of IGVs, by your definition of "as a
19 function of."
20 Q When had you first formed that belief, that is
21 the belief that the delta P/P setpoint should be a
22 function of the inlet guide vane?
23 A I don't know.
24 Q Was that concept for the surge control system
25 something that was generated by Sundstrand or Turbomeca?

167

1 setpoint or reference measurement of delta P/P?
2 A Define what you mean by "actual measurement."
3 Q Well, a measurement of the delta P/P of the
4 system in operation.
5 A This system never operated.
6 Q Yes, sir, but the proposed system that's being
7 depicted here proposed comparing delta P/P as actually
8 measured to a setpoint reference value, correct?
9 A I can't answer that question.
10 Q Why not?
11 A Because you say "actual measurements." There
12 was never an actual measurement.
13 Q Yes, sir, but when you do a diagram of a system
14 that is proposed, your understanding about how that
15 system would work if it was actually working, right?
16 A Do you mean that the measured value?
17 Q Yes, sir. So am I correct that this diagram,
18 page HSA-176198, shows a proposed system in which a
19 measured value of delta P/P would be compared to a
20 setpoint or reference value of delta P/P?
21 A Yes.
22 Q And am I correct that the setpoint or reference
23 value of delta P/P in the system proposed on this
24 diagram would be -- or would vary as a function of the
25 position of the inlet guide vanes?

166

1 A Sundstrand.
2 Q Okay. Was that generated by other people at
3 Sundstrand or did you play a role in the development of
4 that concept?
5 A Other people.
6 Q Who?
7 A Wendell Reed.
8 Q And at the time that you started working on the
9 APS 3000 in late 1989, had Mr. Reed already determined
10 to use or to use a delta P/P setpoint that was a
11 function of the inlet guide vanes?
12 A No.
13 Q Okay. At some point did you change your mind
14 and decide not to use a delta P/P setpoint that was a
15 function of the inlet guide vanes?
16 A Yes.
17 Q And am I correct that in the actual APS 3200,
18 the delta P/P setpoint is a -- well, what's it a
19 function of in the actual APS 3200?
20 A Inlet temperature.
21 Q When was the change made from a function of
22 inlet guide vanes to a function of inlet temperature?
23 A There was multiple steps.
24 Q Okay. When was the change made away from a
25 function of inlet guide vanes?

168

42 (Pages 165 to 168)

ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES
(619) 233-0633 (800) 829-6159

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 A When we found out that the delta P/P curve was
2 not a function of IGVs in the late 1990 time frame.
3 Q What was it that you found that made you think
4 it was not a function of IGV?
5 A We were provided information by Turbomeca.
6 Q You referred to a delta P/P curve. What did
7 you mean by that?
8 A A relationship between delta P static and P
9 static and air flow, load compressor air flow.
10 Q And what was it that Turbomeca had told you in
11 late 1990 about that relationship?
12 A That it was unique, it was not a function of
13 IGVs.
14 Q What do you mean by "unique"?
15 A It made no difference what the IGV angle was.
16 The relationship delta P/P static as I've described was
17 a function of flow, independent of IGV angle.
18 Q And how was it that Turbomeca had determined
19 this?
20 A I don't know.
21 Q Who at Turbomeca told you that?
22 A I received it in a Coordination Memo.
23 Q And who was the author of the Coordination
24 Memo, do you recall?
25 A I don't recall.

169

1 device.
2 Q A Venturi flow measuring?
3 A Venturi.
4 Q Can you spell that?
5 A V-e-n-t-u-r-i.
6 Q What is a Venturi flow measuring device?
7 A A device which can sense air flow.
8 Q Okay. And was it measuring -- what was it
9 going to measure, what was the P and what was the delta
10 P?
11 A The Venturi by its geometry creates a pressure
12 differential in the device itself. The Ps and the Ts
13 were intended to be the pressures as measured by the
14 Venturi.
15 Q And was this comparing total pressure to static
16 pressure or static pressure to a delta static pressure?
17 A I don't recall exactly.
18 Q Okay. In this diagram that we're looking at,
19 the setpoint is expressed as a function of the IGV. You
20 said that then for a period of time the setpoint was a
21 constant figure. And was it after that that the
22 setpoint was expressed as a function of inlet
23 temperature?
24 A Yes.
25 Q Am I correct that inlet temperature is directly

171

1 Q You said that the determination of the delta
2 P/P setpoint was expressed in a number of different ways
3 during the development of the 3000 and the 3200. How
4 was it expressed after you expressed it as a function of
5 IGV?
6 A It was not expressed.
7 Q Well, were there interim steps between as a
8 function of IGV and as a function of inlet temperature?
9 A No.
10 Q Starting in late 1990, continuing until the
11 actual production version of the APS 3200, was the
12 setpoint always expressed as a function of inlet
13 temperature?
14 A No.
15 Q How else was it expressed?
16 A Fixed value.
17 Q And for what period of time was it expressed as
18 a fixed value?
19 A I don't recall exactly.
20 Q The delta P/P that is suggested here in Exhibit
21 22, page HSA-176198, is that the same delta P/P that you
22 measure in the actual APS 3200 today?
23 A No.
24 Q How is it different?
25 A The proposal was using a Venturi flow measuring

170

1 related to inlet pressure?
2 A No.
3 Q Am I right that as a matter of physics,
4 pressure and temperature have a relationship to each
5 other?
6 A No.
7 Q What's the relationship between pressure and
8 temperature?
9 A Weather.
10 Q What do you mean?
11 A Weather.
12 Q What do you mean by "weather"?
13 A Any day, there can be a temperature and a
14 pressure. There is no relationship between the two.
15 Q Who was it that determined that the setpoint in
16 the APS 3200 should be determined as a function of
17 temperature?
18 A I don't recall.
19 Q Was it someone at Sundstrand or someone at
20 Turbomeca?
21 A Someone at Turbomeca.
22 Q Was that a determination that you or your team
23 played any part in?
24 A No.
25 MR. PUTNAM: Let's take a short break.

172

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 (Recess.)
2 BY MR. PUTNAM:
3 Q Mr. Suttie, can you pull out again Suttie
4 Exhibit 8 which is a document we looked at earlier. Do
5 you have Exhibit 8 in front of you?
6 A I do.
7 Q And under the heading of No. 2, do you recall
8 there was a reference to a B. Macarez and data that he
9 had supplied?
10 A Yes.
11 Q Can you tell me what Mr. Macarez's full name
12 was?
13 A Bernie Macarez.
14 Q Can you tell me what role Mr. Macarez played in
15 the design and development of the APS 3200?
16 A His function was coordination, liaison between
17 Turbomeca and Sundstrand.
18 Q And were there particular parts of the APU that
19 he worked on or had responsibility for?
20 A No.
21 Q Are you familiar with an individual named
22 Terry Maedche?
23 A Maedche.
24 Q Terry Maedche, are you familiar with him?
25 A Yes.

173

1 A Steve Lampe.
2 Q Are you familiar with an Alan Greubel?
3 A Yes.
4 Q And who was Mr. Greubel?
5 A He's another systems design engineer.
6 Q And did he work on the development of the bleed
7 control valve system for the APS 3200?
8 A Yes.
9 Q And what particular role did Mr. Greubel play?
10 A I don't recall.
11 Q Are you familiar with a gentleman named
12 Edward Edelman?
13 A Yes.
14 Q Who is Mr. Edelman?
15 A He was another systems design engineer.
16 Q And did he work on the development of the bleed
17 control valve system for the APS 3200 for Sundstrand?
18 A Yes.
19 Q What particular part of the APS 3200 did he
20 work on?
21 A Can you be more specific?
22 Q What particular part of the bleed control valve
23 system did Mr. Edelman work on?
24 A All of it.
25 Q Did Mr. Edelman have a significant role in

175

1 Q Was he a Sundstrand employee who worked on the
2 design and development of the APS 3200?
3 A In its latter stages, yes.
4 Q What do you mean, "in its latter stages"?
5 A I don't recall exactly when he joined the
6 company, but I think it was 1992, late '92.
7 Q And what were his duties and responsibilities
8 in the development of the APS 3200?
9 A System design engineer.
10 Q A system design engineer?
11 A Yeah.
12 Q And what system was he responsible for?
13 A He worked along with others on the APS 3200.
14 Q Okay. Did he work on the control systems for
15 the APS 3200?
16 A Yes.
17 Q Did Mr. Maedche work on the bleed control valve
18 for the APS 3200?
19 A Amongst other things, yes.
20 Q And did you supervise Mr. Maedche in his work
21 on the bleed control valve on the APS 3200?
22 A No.
23 Q Did someone else supervise him?
24 A Someone else was his supervisor, yes.
25 Q Who was that?

174

1 developing the bleed control valve system for the
2 APS 3200?
3 A What do you mean by "significant"?
4 Q Did he make a significant contribution to your
5 development of the bleed control valve system for the
6 APS 3200?
7 A I still don't understand your question.
8 Q What do you understand by the meaning of the
9 word "significant"?
10 A A very large contribution.
11 Q Did Mr. Edelman make a very large contribution
12 to the development of the bleed control valve system for
13 the APS 3200?
14 A Yes.
15 Q Are you familiar with an individual named
16 Branch Crooks?
17 A Yes.
18 Q Who is Mr. Crooks?
19 A Another systems design engineer.
20 Q Did he play a role in the development of the
21 bleed control valve system for the APS 3200?
22 A Not the initial design.
23 Q But did he play a role in the subsequent design
24 and development of the bleed control valve system for
25 the APS 3200?

176

44 (Pages 173 to 176)

ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES
(619) 233-0633 (800) 829-6159

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 A Yes.
2 Q Let me see if I can do this. I'd like to get
3 from you every Sundstrand employee who played a role in
4 the development of the bleed control valve system for
5 the APS 3200. And you've told me that you played such a
6 role, you've told me that Mr. Maedche played such a
7 role, that Mr. Edelman played such a role, that
8 Mr. Greubel played such a role, and Mr. Crooks played
9 such a role. Can you tell me anyone else who played a
10 role in the development of the bleed control valve
11 system for the APS 3200 at Sundstrand?
12 A Yes.
13 Q Who else?
14 A Kourosh Mehr-Ayin.
15 Q Anyone else?
16 A Steve Lampe.
17 Q Anyone else?
18 A Wendell Reed.
19 Q Anyone else?
20 A Malcolm McArthur.
21 Q Anyone else?
22 A That's all I recall.
23 Q Can you tell me which of the individuals that
24 we've just described made the most significant role, the
25 largest contribution to the development of the bleed

177

1 A Can you repeat the question.
2 (Last question read.)
3 THE WITNESS: No.
4 BY MR. PUTNAM:
5 Q Mr. Greubel, do you know where he worked before
6 he came to Sundstrand?
7 A Can you be more specific?
8 Q Well, did Mr. Greubel work for Allied Signal
9 before he came to Sundstrand?
10 A Yes.
11 Q Did he work on Allied Signal's APUs before he
12 came to work for Sundstrand?
13 A I do not know.
14 Q Does Mr. Greubel still work for Sundstrand?
15 A He currently works for Sundstrand.
16 Q Okay. Mr. Edelman, am I correct that
17 Mr. Edelman worked at Allied Signal before he came to
18 Sundstrand?
19 MR. MCCracken: Objection; irrelevant.
20 THE WITNESS: I don't recall.
21 BY MR. PUTNAM:
22 Q Does Mr. Edelman still work currently for
23 Sundstrand?
24 A No.
25 Q Approximately when did Mr. Edelman depart from

179

1 control valve for the APS 3200?
2 Let me ask the question again.
3 Tell me which of the individuals that you've
4 just identified or that I listed for you played the most
5 significant role in the development of the bleed control
6 valve system for the APS 3200.
7 A In my estimate, that would be Kourosh
8 Mehr-Ayin.
9 Q Did any other person make a comparable
10 contribution to Mr. Mehr-Ayin or was he alone at the
11 head of the list in your understanding?
12 A I would say Ed Edelman made a large
13 contribution.
14 Q Would it be fair to say that Mr. Edelman and
15 Mr. Mehr-Ayin are roughly equivalent in the level of
16 contribution they made to the bleed control valve system
17 of the APS 3200?
18 A Roughly.
19 Q And is there anyone else who you would put at
20 that same rough level in terms of level of contribution
21 to the APS 3200 bleed control valve system?
22 A No.
23 Q Is there someone at Sundstrand who was
24 responsible for the development of the systems relating
25 to the inlet guide vanes on the APS 3200?

178

1 Sundstrand?
2 A Approximately the end of 1995, beginning '96.
3 Q Do you know where Mr. Edelman works currently?
4 A I don't know.
5 Q Do you have any understanding of where he
6 works?
7 A I could -- no.
8 Q Has anyone ever told you where Mr. Edelman
9 worked or went to work after he left Sundstrand?
10 A Yes.
11 Q Where is that?
12 MR. MCCracken: Objection; hearsay.
13 BY MR. PUTNAM:
14 Q Where was that?
15 A A company called Capstone.
16 Q Mr. Maedche, am I correct that Mr. Maedche
17 worked at Allied Signal before he came to Sundstrand?
18 A Yes.
19 Q And do you know that Mr. Maedche worked on APUs
20 at Allied Signal before he came to Sundstrand?
21 A I do not know.
22 Q Does Mr. Maedche currently work at Sundstrand?
23 A No.
24 Q Approximately when did he leave?
25 A Early '94.

180

45 (Pages 177 to 180)

ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES
(619) 233-0633 (800) 829-6159

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL. 1
06/14/00

1 Q And do you know where Mr. Maedche went when he
2 left Sundstrand?
3 A No.
4 Q Do you have any understanding or has anyone
5 ever told you where he went?
6 A No.
7 Q Mr. Crooks, do you know that Mr. Crooks worked
8 at Allied Signal before he went to Sundstrand?
9 A Yes.
10 Q And do you know that Mr. Crooks worked on APUS
11 at Allied Signal before he came to Sundstrand?
12 A I do not know.
13 Q Does Mr. Crooks still work for Sundstrand?
14 A Don't know.
15 Q Mr. Macarez, the individual we saw in Suttie
16 Exhibit 8, do you know that he worked for Allied Signal
17 before he came to Sundstrand?
18 A Can you restate the question.
19 (Last question read.)
20 THE WITNESS: I don't recall.
21 BY MR. PUTNAM:
22 Q Does Mr. Macarez currently work for Sundstrand?
23 A No.
24 Q Do you know approximately when he left?
25 A He never worked for Sundstrand.

181

1 1999. Do you recall if it would have been before or
2 after May 1999?
3 A I think it was before.
4 Q During the time that you were designing and
5 developing the APS 3200, was there ever any
6 consideration about whether that design might infringe
7 someone else's patent rights?
8 MR. MCCracken: Objection. To the extent that
9 it requests information communicated to him by a lawyer,
10 that information is privileged, and to that extent I
11 would ask the witness not to answer on that. As to
12 other matters, the witness is free to go ahead.
13 MR. PUTNAM: Well, the question is just a yes
14 or no question. He can give a yes or no answer.
15 May the court reporter restate the question,
16 please.
17 (Last question read.)
18 THE WITNESS: Not that I recall.
19 BY MR. PUTNAM:
20 Q To your knowledge, was there any effort
21 undertaken by Sundstrand to determine whether there
22 might be patents on aspects of APU technology that would
23 be implicated by the APS 3200?
24 A I don't know.
25 Q Are you aware of any such efforts?

183

1 Q I thought you had testified earlier that
2 Mr. Macarez was the person responsible for coordinating
3 efforts between Sundstrand and Turbomeca; is that
4 correct?
5 A Correct.
6 Q Was he a Turbomeca employee?
7 A Yes.
8 Q Do you know if Mr. Macarez still works for
9 Turbomeca?
10 A I do not know.
11 Q Was Mr. Macarez -- as of October 1992 when
12 Suttie Exhibit 8 was written, Mr. Macarez was stationed
13 in San Diego; is that correct?
14 A I don't recall exactly the dates.
15 Q Well, in general, when he was serving this
16 liaison function, was he physically stationed in
17 San Diego as opposed to France?
18 A Yes.
19 Q When did you first learn -- I'm just looking
20 for a date. When did you first learn that Allied Signal
21 was making allegations that the APS 3200 infringed one
22 or more of its patents?
23 A I don't recall exactly.
24 Q The lawsuit in this case, the original
25 complaint was filed by Allied Signal I think in May

182

1 A No.
2 Q Did you ever direct anyone to undertake a
3 search as to whether there might be patent rights of
4 others that might be implicated by the APS 3200?
5 A No.
6 Q Is it fair to say that the development of the
7 APS 3200 took place between late 1989 and 1994?
8 A No.
9 Q What period of time would you say the
10 development of the APS 3200 took place during?
11 A Late '89 through late '93.
12 Q During the period from late 1989 to late 1993,
13 I take it you were aware that Allied Signal also
14 manufactured and sold APUS similar in size and output to
15 the APS 3200, correct?
16 A Yes.
17 Q During that time were there any other companies
18 you were aware of in the world that manufactured and
19 sold APUS of that size?
20 A None that I was aware of.
21 MR. PUTNAM: Off the record.
22 (Discussion off the record.)
23 MR. PUTNAM: Back on the record.
24 Can you mark this as the next exhibit, please.
25 (Deposition Exhibit 23 marked.)

184

46 (Pages 181 to 184)

ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES
(619) 233-0633 (800) 829-6159

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 BY MR. PUTNAM:
2 Q Mr. Suttie, I've handed you what the court
3 reporter has marked as Suttie Deposition Exhibit 23, and
4 let me ask you if you can identify that document.
5 A It appears to be a Program Management Review.
6 Q And have you seen documents of this sort inside
7 Sundstrand during your work there?
8 A Yes.
9 Q What's a Program Management Review inside
10 Sundstrand?
11 A A general review of all subjects relating to
12 the APU.
13 Q Did you play any role in generating or creating
14 the Program Management Review that I've given to you as
15 Suttie Exhibit 23?
16 A I don't recall.
17 Q Are Program Management Reviews reviews that are
18 internal to Sundstrand or reviews that take place with
19 external customers?
20 A Internal with Sundstrand.
21 Q Typically would this be a review where, for
22 instance, the APS 3200 program team would report on the
23 program to senior management inside Sundstrand?
24 A No. No.
25 Q Okay. Let me ask you to turn to HSA 156127

185

1 later on off the record. In fact, there's an explicit
2 agreement that damages discovery can go forward now,
3 that liability discovery has an earlier discovery than
4 damages discovery if there's no conclusion on damages
5 discovery. But given I've got eight minutes left with
6 the witness, I'd like to move on.
7 Q Mr. Suttie, let me ask you to turn to the page
8 with production number HSA 156132. Do you have that
9 page in front of you?
10 A Yes.
11 Q And do you see that the lower slide is one
12 labeled "Competition"?
13 A Yes.
14 Q What information were you trying to convey to
15 your management with that slide?
16 A What the competition was.
17 Q And in October 1996 what was the competition
18 for the APS 3200?
19 A The Allied Signal 36-300, and in the future,
20 the Allied Signal 131-9.
21 Q Were any other APUs competition or anticipated
22 competition for the APS 3200 at the time?
23 A No.
24 Q Now, under the Allied Signal 131-9, do you see
25 that the first tick mark says "available late 1998"?

187

1 which is part of Exhibit 23. Do you have that in front
2 of you?
3 A Uh-huh.
4 Q Do you see that the first slide has your name
5 on it and the date October 3rd, 1996?
6 A Uh-huh.
7 Q I'm sorry, you need to answer with words.
8 A Yes.
9 Q Does that help refresh your memory that at
10 least the portion of the exhibit starting there is
11 something that you presented in October 1996?
12 A Yes. The program team wasn't there, just me.
13 Q Okay. To whom did you present these materials
14 in October 1996?
15 A I don't recall.
16 Q Was it some part of Sundstrand management?
17 A Yes.
18 MR. MCCracken: Jonathan, I believe there's an
19 agreement to limit discovery at this time to liability
20 issues.
21 MR. PUTNAM: No, sir, there's not.
22 MR. MCCracken: That the damages portion
23 would -- the discovery would happen downstream.
24 MR. PUTNAM: Well, first of all, I'd like to
25 finish with this document. I'm happy to discuss that

186

1 A Yes.
2 Q And can you read into the record the next tick
3 mark under that?
4 A In quotation marks the word "copy of the
5 APS 3200."
6 Q What did you mean when you conveyed to your
7 management that the Allied Signal 131-9 was a copy of
8 the APS 3200?
9 A I meant that the APU was geometrically similar
10 to the APS 3200.
11 Q What do you mean by "geometrically similar"?
12 A The geometry, size.
13 Q Okay. How would you know that the
14 Allied Signal 131-9 was a, in your words, copy of the
15 APS 3200?
16 A I don't recall.
17 Q What information did you have about the 131-9
18 at the time that you made this statement in this
19 document?
20 A I don't recall.
21 Q Who had told you about the 131-9 to enable you
22 to make this statement in the document?
23 MR. MCCracken: Objection; assumes a fact not
24 in evidence.
25 THE WITNESS: I don't recall.

188

HONEYWELL V.
HAMILTON SUNDSTRAND CORP.

PETER J. SUTTIE, VOL 1
06/14/00

1 BY MR. PUTNAM:

2 Q Based on what you know today, is it fair to
3 call the Allied Signal 131-9 APU a copy of the APS 32007

4 A Yes.

5 Q All right. That's all I have on that document
6 for the time being.

7 MR. McCracken, you have indicated previously
8 that the witness needs to leave by 5:15. It's now
9 5:10. In order to accommodate the witness's schedule,
10 I'm happy to suspend the deposition for today. We have
11 discussed off the record rescheduling the deposition or
12 scheduling the continuation of the deposition. I've
13 offered to go forward with Mr. Suttie tomorrow in a
14 simultaneous deposition with him and Mr. Szillat. You
15 indicated that that's not feasible, and I've said I'm
16 happy to work out a mutually agreeable date in the
17 coming weeks to continue Mr. Suttie's deposition.

18 MR. MCCracken: Thank you. May we have copies
19 of the exhibits that we currently do not have copies of
20 that we can take with us?

21 MR. PUTNAM: Could we go off the record?

22 MR. MCCracken: Yes, that's fine.

23 /

24 /

25

189

1 STATE OF CALIFORNIA)

2) ss

3 COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO)

4

5 I, the undersigned, a Certified Shorthand
6 Reporter of the State of California, do hereby certify:

7 That the foregoing proceedings were taken
8 before me at the time and place herein set forth; that
9 any witnesses in the foregoing proceedings, prior to
10 testifying, were placed under oath; that a verbatim
11 record of the proceedings was made by me using machine
12 shorthand which was thereafter transcribed under my
13 direction; further, that the foregoing is an accurate
14 transcription thereof.

15 I further certify that I am neither financially
16 interested in the action nor a relative or employee of
17 any attorney of any of the parties.

18 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have this date subscribed
19 my name.

20 Dated: _____

21

22

23

24

25

JOYCE E. HOSTETLER
CSR No. 5216

191

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9 I, PETER J. SUTTIE, do hereby declare under
10 penalty of perjury that I have read the foregoing
11 transcript, that I have made such corrections as noted
12 herein, in ink, initialed by me, or attached hereto;
13 that my testimony as contained herein, as corrected, is
14 true and correct.

15 EXECUTED this ____ day of _____,

16
17 19____, at _____
18 (City) (State)

19
20 _____
21 PETER J. SUTTIE

22
23
24
25

190